

HIDDEN TREASURES POWERPOINT TALKING POINTS

SLIDE 1

- The sponsoring organization for the study I want to tell you about is the Cincinnati Association, a non-profit civic volunteer organization founded originally in 1920 to fight corruption in City government. At the time, city government was essentially controlled by a political machine dominated by a person named “Boss” Cox. The remedy was the Charter form of government, first employed in the United States in Cincinnati, promoted by the Charter Party, which still exists today.
- Nowadays, the Association’s quality-of-life-improvement efforts are coordinated by four sub-groups, known as panels, each focusing on a specific mission of its own. The four current panels are: Excellence in Government, Excellence in Education, Arts & Culture, and Community Inclusion. This research was proposed and executed under the direction of the Community Inclusion Panel, of which I was co-chair at the time.

SLIDE 2

- Up to 1980, the words “stable” and “integrated” were thought of as contradictory. The conventional view was that once blacks moved into a community, it was only a question of time before it would become all black. Another thought commonly associated with blacks moving in was that it inevitably lead to decline of socio-economic status. Simply stated, we asked: What are the current facts about living in integrated neighborhoods?”
- The database we looked at consists of 48 Cincinnati neighborhoods, 35 villages and municipalities outside Cincinnati, and 39 subunits in our county’s 12 townships, adding up to 122 units total.

SLIDE 3

- Part One of the study, performed by Dr. Fritz Casey-Leininger of the University of Cincinnati, covered Hamilton county’s population characteristics by race and socio-economic status.
- Part Two of the study, conducted by Dr. Erinn Green of Wilmington College, consisted of focus group discussions in three neighborhoods, followed by a small number of individual interviews, with the added dimension of having some residents contribute to a photo journal showing what, to them, makes their neighborhood special.

SLIDE 4

- Three criteria were used to identify stable integrated communities: Diversity, Dispersal, and Durability, as shown in this slide.
- The terminology makes a distinction between diversity and integration. In essence, diversity is a necessary but not a sufficient condition for a community to be called integrated. In other words a community can be diverse without being integrated.
- Another term used is “dissimilarity.” It is synonymous with the term “segregation.” The higher the DI, as the Diversity Index is abbreviated, the greater the segregation. A value of 100 means complete segregation; a value of zero means complete integration.
- An integrated community is termed stable if it has been integrated for at least two censuses.

SLIDE 5

- This shows demographic trends. Note that the number of predominantly white communities (green line) in Hamilton County has declined steadily since 1940, though more than half (68) of our 122 communities were still of this kind in 2000.
- Nonetheless, the number of diverse communities (blue curve) has continued to rise to a value of 38, and the number of predominantly black communities (red curve) has leveled off at 16. These trends differ greatly from the picture in 1980, which showed instability in integrated communities, feeding the old storyline.

SLIDE 6

- This slide shows DI benchmark numbers for the total US, for the Cincinnati: Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana PMSA (Primary Metropolitan Statistical Area), and Hamilton County suburbs. By “suburbs” I mean all the non-Cincinnati neighborhoods in Hamilton County. Values of 74 indicate high levels of segregation. In fact the PMSA value was 8th highest among all U. S. PMSA’s, as was widely publicized in 2001.
- Note that the number is 68 for the City of Cincinnati. Note that any number above 60 is generally thought of as “hyper-segregated.”
- Finally, note that 42 is shown as the average for “Gold & Silver Medal” communities, of which there are 14. The terminology is explained on the next slide.

SLIDE 7

- Here I provide the basic definitions of terms used to honor the Hamilton County communities that have achieved stable integration, following Olympic Games tradition.
- Note that, for Gold Medal status a community must have been integrated for 30 years or more, starting in 1970. It could easily have been a longer period, since the achievement may have begun prior to 1970, and it may have persisted beyond 2000. Thirty years is thus a minimum.
- Similarly for Silver Medal and Bronze Medal communities, whose integrated status has persisted for at least 20 and 10 years, respectively.

SLIDE 8

- This slide identifies Hamilton County's only Gold Medal communities as of the 2000 census, ranked in order of declining integration level, i.e., most integrated first, as measured by the Dissimilarity Index. Recall, the lower the number, the lower the segregation.
- Note that two of these communities, Corryville and the Central Business District/Riverfront, are presently undergoing or about to undergo significant changes and hence may be challenged to remain integrated by the criteria of this study in the 2010 census.

SLIDE 9

- This slide identifies 11 Silver Medal communities in order of declining DI. There is one exception to our usual criteria here, Kennedy Heights. It is included as a special exception because, though it reached 75% black in the 1980 census, it did not increase beyond that number in the 1990 and 2000 censuses.
- Note that all but one of the communities listed here are Cincinnati neighborhoods. The exception is the City of Forest Park. Note also that all these communities have DI's below 60, the hyper-segregation threshold.
- Significantly, we found ten Bronze Medal communities that were found integrated in 1990 and 2000. Among these, two are suburban cities (Springdale and Mt. Healthy) and three are township communities (Finneytown and Pleasant Run Farms in Springfield Township and Mt. Healthy Heights in Colerain Township). This gives a total of five suburban Bronze Medal locations that may become Silver in 2010.

SLIDE 10

- Following the precedent of University of Cincinnati Prof. Michael Maloney and colleagues, values for the Socio-Economic Status (SES) Index were calculated for all 122 Hamilton County neighborhoods.
- The five components that make up the index are shown in this slide. The **education component** is the percentage of those 25 years or older with a high school diploma or higher; the **dwelling unit occupancy component** is the percentage of occupied dwelling units with one person per room or fewer; the **family structure component** is based on the percentage of children in two-parent families; and the **occupation component** refers to the percentage of workers in skilled jobs.

SLIDE 11

- The SES Index scale is essentially a rank-ordering scale that goes from 1 to 100, from lowest to highest among the 122 Hamilton County communities.
- This slide shows benchmark values. OTR and Lower Price Hill had SES Index values of 1 and 9, respectively, averaging 5. Similarly, Mt. Lookout and Indian Hill had values of 90 and 100, respectively averaging 95. The value for the City of Cincinnati, 40, is seen to fall significantly below the value for Hamilton County suburbs; however, the value for the 14 Gold and Silver Medal Stable Integrated Communities (SIC's), taken together, is very close to it.

SLIDE 12

- The values shown in the previous slide are only for the year 2000. Looking at the history of these values over three decades from 1980 to 2000, it was found that the average value for the 14 Gold and Silver Medal SIC's remained essentially at the value of 50, as shown in this slide.
- Note that while the SES Index remained constant, the black population in these communities rose from 30% to 46%. This amounts to an increase of greater than 50% in the black population of these communities.
- Note that, for the perception of the impact of this population change to have been based on fact, the SES Index would have had to have gone down.

SLIDE 13

- The second part of the research focused on the three, representative SIC's, whose characteristics are summarized here. We only did three because that is all we could afford to do.
- Note that Madisonville is one of the three Gold Medal communities, and it had a DI less than 50. For information, it had a 10-point rise in its SES Index after 1980.
- Note that Pleasant Ridge had a year 2000 SES Index higher than the suburban average, 54, shown earlier.

SLIDE 14

- Two large group events were held in each neighborhood where participants were first asked to give their assessment of the topics shown here and then asked to prioritize the themes that emerged.
- Following this there was a second phase for four participants per neighborhood, the photography phase, which yielded altogether 21 photos, each with its own narrative provided by the persons who took the photographs.
- Three residents per neighborhood participated in the third phase, which was the direct one-on-one personal interview phase.

SLIDE 15

- This slide presents the eight major themes that emerged from citizen input.
- The second bullet expresses a sentiment that is increasingly widespread. It is spoken of frequently as the reason why some people have chosen to live where they do.
- The sixth bullet expresses a thought that is contrary to common perceptions, but backed up by the hard data.
- The final bullet is a way of saying something not only about adult relationships, but also about concern for the youth in the neighborhood. In fact, if there is something all themes have in common, it is an emphasis on the value of relationships.

SLIDE 16

- In brief, our findings do not support conventional notions about integrated communities, either in the inevitability of their becoming predominantly black, or in the expectation that the neighborhood will go downhill socio-economically.
- On the contrary, we found that there is much to celebrate in the stable integrated communities that now exist—we call them “Hidden Treasures” for this very reason—of which 11 Silver Medal Communities and ten Bronze are in the pipeline to become Gold and Silver in 2010.
- The hope is that these findings will form the basis for new perceptions, become a new conventional wisdom.

SLIDE 17

- More specifically, we’d like to see integrated community numbers grow, and we will do all that we can, in concert with other organizations that share this interest, to build on the pride we’ve already heard expressed.
- We will also seek to achieve this growth through a combination of public policy and industry practices that support this aspiration.
- An event possibly in September is now being planned to take some steps forward toward this objective.

SLIDE 18

- We have to thank the Wilder Foundation for supporting this work in the amount of a grant for \$20,000.
- The full text of the report can be found at the indicated website.

B. H. Wiers
July 1, 2008